# Agenda Item 7 - Report regarding the work of the Dorset Health Scrutiny Committee Task and Finish Group Re: Clinical Services Review

The following public feedback has been received in relation to the Clinical Services Review in response to social media activity.

## 1. Sarah Whittle, Blandford Forum Resident

I am writing to express my very strong objection to the proposed closure of Poole a and e. As a resident of North Dorset. I am quite frankly terrified at the idea of having to travel to Bournemouth to access an a and e department. Apart from four years nursing at St Thomas' in London I have lived all my life in Dorset. I have watched as the chaos caused by traffic congestion has increased journey times all over the county. How anyone in their right mind could consider the journey from north Dorset or indeed Purbeck to Bournemouth would be safe beggars belief! So much for the golden hour. In addition Poole is a superb, award winning department with excellent staff and most importantly a wealth of experience. Emergency work depends on team work which takes years to develop. Why break something that works so well? The whole plan has been ill thought out and smacks of short termism.

## 2. Donna Sparrowhawk, Weymouth Resident

I support those who want the committee to please vote to refer the CCG plans to downgrade Poole A&E and close Poole Maternity for Independent Review, because of the known risk to residents.

# 3. Jane Gladding & David Foster, Swanage Residents

We are asking you to refer for independent review the CCG's plans to close A&E and Maternity at Poole due to the because of the known risk to us the residents of Swanage!

## 4. Robert Gilmore, Swanage Resident

I write to register my dismay at the CCGs proposal to close Poole A & E and Maternity without full investigation of the likely consequences of such a move and the risk of poor outcomes brought about by increased journey times. The centralisation proposed in a county as big as Dorset will almost inevitably lead to higher mortality rates in A & E patients and it would seem that incomplete information was delivered to the panel making this decision. I would therefore ask that the current plans be referred for further independent investigation before this bizarre decision is implemented.

## 5. Lynda Gilmore, Swanage Resident

Please note my extreme concern at the above proposals which would appear to have been made without full investigation of the consequences. The centralisation proposed - and Bournemouth is hardly 'central' in Dorset - would be very likely to lead to higher mortality rates and poorer outcomes by substantially increasing journey times. I request the current proposals be referred for independent investigation with full information available.

## 6. Emily Bosher, Bridport Resident

As a Dorset resident and mother, I'm extremely concerned about the CCG's dangerous plans to close services at Poole hospital. These must be referred for

independent review because the dangers are well known to residents such as myself and will therefore affect myself and my loved ones.

## 7. Adrienne Shaw, Pimperne Resident

I write to express my concern about the closure of these services at Poole. I believe that there will be considerable risk to many Dorset residents if the plans go ahead. I urge the committee to refer these plans for independent review.

## 8. Sue Spilling, Swanage Resident

I understand that the Dorset Health Scrutiny Committee will be voting on 13 September on whether or not to refer to Secretary of State for independent review, the CCG's plans to downgrade A&E and close Maternity at Poole. I believe it is vital for the committee to vote to refer those plans because of the known risk to Dorset residents. Dorset CCG knew in August 2017 that at least 396 Dorset patients would be put at risk each year due to loss of Poole A&E and Maternity. Yet in their Decision Making Business Case of September 2017 they said the clinical risk to Dorset patients was 'minimal'.

As a Dorset resident it is extremely worrying that a decision could be made to put at risk so many local peoples' lives. I believe the DHS Cttee has a responsibility as an elected body to oppose the downgrade and closure

## 9. Alex Fuhrmann, Weymouth Resident

Could you please pass on my message - I think that Dorset Health Scrutiny Committee should vote on 13th September to refer the CCG plans to downgrade Poole A&E and close Poole Maternity for Independent Review. I find this the fairest way to judge the true impact without political bias or risk to the community.

# 10. Amanda Mansbridge, Swanage Resident

I am contacting you this morning regarding the extremely worrying situation regarding Dorset CCG's proposed plans to downgrade Poole A&E and close Poole Maternity. I firmly believe that Dorset Health Scrutiny Committee must vote on 13<sup>th</sup> September to refer the CCG plans regarding the aforementioned departments within Poole hospital, the risk is known and verified, surely for once can the powers that be consider the clarity of the evidence provided, rather than simply evaluating the financial 'benefits'. We believe ourselves to be a civilised society valuing human life, how on earth can this be maintained when 'The Golden Hour' required to sustain life in a variety of medical emergencies will be non-existent due the distances required by ambulances to travel? Residents in the Purbeck area are frightened...

## 11. Name Withheld, Swanage Resident

I am writing to ask that the Scrutiny committee, voting in September, PLEASE refer the decision to downgrade A&E and maternity services at Poole Hospital to Independent review. I am a resident of Purbeck and Poole hospital is my local A&E.

I am writing this e mail in both my capacity as an NHS professional of 40 years standing and as a current patient at Poole hospital receiving lifesaving treatment. I may need the services of A&E at any time and the travel time to Bournemouth hospital is just too long and similarly for Dorchester. This is even more crucial in the tourist season where travel times are increased everywhere on Purbeck.

I have already been told by clinicians, that if I have life threatening side effects from my treatment, that because I live in Swanage, I may not even get to Poole hospital on time. How much worse might this be if I have to travel even further. I hope once my treatment is finished that I will be able to return to my NHS job, but I can't if I am dead because of cuts to vital services.

This applies to so many others in Purbeck, whose average age is on the higher side, and who have multiple serious health issues. Please pass this e mail on to the relevant bodies.

# 12. Graham and Geraldine Wetten, Corfe Castle Residents

I urge the Dorset Health Scrutiny Committee to vote to refer the CCG plans to downgrade Poole A&E and close Poole Maternity Unit for Independent Review. As residents of Purbeck, we and our family are particularly vulnerable to these proposals. The Committee should be reminded of the recent Judicial Review hearing where discrepancies in the proposed provision, procedure and decision making were highlighted.

## 13. Dr Andrew Larner, Swanage Resident

I am a resident of Swanage on the isle of Purbeck. I think that Dorset Health Scrutiny Committee must vote on 13th September to refer the CCG plans to downgrade Poole A&E and close Poole Maternity for Independent Review, because of the known risk to residents.

## 14. Robert Mercer, Corfe Castle Resident

Just before Christmas 2017 my wife had a choking attack as a consequence of her Parkinson's. She had a cardiac arrest and was given CPR by my daughter-in-law. Rapid transfer to Poole A&E resulted in a gradual but slow recovery. There is no doubt in my mind that a transfer to a more distant hospital on that particular day would have caused her death. The trauma doctor at Poole confirmed this. Those of us who are fortunate to live in the lovely Isle of Purbeck are already aware that we are rather cut off from the outside world and are used to hearing ambulances doing their best to get along the A351 towards Poole. All we can do is offer a silent prayer that they arrive in time. Please use your best efforts and vote to ensure that the present plan by the CCG to downgrade Poole is reversed.

## 15. Pippa Shillington, Gillingham Resident

Dorset CCG's plans for the county's health services MUST be referred for independent review. The consultation was inadequate and from the evidence of the High Court in July, we know it was misleading regarding the number of people being put at risk.

## 16. Kevin Shillington, Gillingham Resident

It is imperative that the CCG's plan for Dorset's health services must be referred for independent review. The consultation was a fraud – I attended the one at Shaftesbury and the most senior person there made it clear that the purpose of the so-called 'consultation' was "to reassure the public" about their plans. That is not consultation, where decision has already been made. And now we have the evidence of the High Court showing that they were deliberately covering up the extent of people who would be put at risk.

## 17. Natasha Wood, Dorchester Resident

I understand you are the clerk to the health scrutiny committee. As a health carer I would hope that mine and others concerns about the danger of moving Poole A&E and cuts to Portland beds, can be communicated and heard by the elected councillors of Dorset.

I'm concerned by the lack of assessments surrounding travel time and risk to life that is certainly NOT "minimal" which is the claim made by CCG in their business case in 2017. Therefore it could be put to the CCG, their clinical decision making was fundamentally misleading. When they knew in reality it was 396 Patients at risk, nowhere like the 60 patients they say? With this information on board I think this decisions to close Poole A&E and maternity services should be referred. Please feed back my views to the health scrutiny committee.

## 18. Maureen Saunders, Swanage Resident

I understand that Dorset Health Scrutiny are voting on the 13th September on whether or not to refer for independent review the plans of Dorset CCG to downgrade Poole General Hospital (PGH) and move all emergency medical services, emergency trauma services, paediatric services, invasive Maternity/Obstetric care and Neo-Natal ICU to the Royal Bournemouth Hospital (RBH). The proposed reorganisation worries and angers me considerably. I sincerely hope that Dorset Health Scrutiny consider the needs of the WHOLE of Dorset and oppose these plans in whatever manner they are able. My reasons are:

- 1. The Consultation document and questionnaire was extremely biased and very cleverly designed to mislead the general public. I am a retired Critical Care Nurse and it took me hours to unravel what was said, read between the lines, and answer the questionnaire honestly. I was totally shocked at it and remain so. One of the reasons quoted in the document in favour of RBH was that the residents of West Hampshire would prefer that option. Does this give Dorset Health a financial advantage? Why else would it even be a consideration? The residents of West Hampshire already have a centre of excellent in their own County, i.e. Southampton Hospital. Dorset will never have that. It must be very wrong to locate the second-best option so close to the existing centre of excellence.
- 2. I believe (from speaking to many friends, family, acquaintances etc.,etc.) that people still do not understand the scale of this re-organisation. In particular what EXACTLY PGH will no longer deal with, e.g. medical admissions for the care of people with conditions such as all cardiac conditions, all respiratory (chest infections, asthma, COPD, pneumonia and so on), neurological (strokes, bells palsy, fitting), problems arising from Diabetes, infections from any source, sepsis, dehydration. I could go on and on!
- 3. Dorset is a rural County. I can easily believe that the highest concentration of people reside in the Poole/Bournemouth conurbation, but having the emergency hospital in either place would not really put them under any increased risk.
- 4. Dorset County Hospital may be going to retain SOME services but can that organisation really cope with a huge influx of extra patients, particularly in the tourist season? And if the stated reason to improve standards and expertise by centralising

IS true, then what does that say about the people who will have no option but to use Dorset C. Hospital?

5. It is impossible to get to RBH from say Swanage or Wareham within the "golden hour", even with blue lights in the winter months, to say nothing of August. I believe this is factual information but no doubt you can check this. The Sandbanks Ferry, brilliant though it is, cannot be relied upon 24 hours, 365 days a year. A great many people arrive at A & E by private car who shouldn't due to their condition. I know this from personal experience but there will be statistics available that you can check. 6. PGH is 20 years older than RBH and is on a cramped site, but some years ago there were plans to build a new Woman's Hospital and enlarge the A. & E in the existing space. Plans were on display in the entrance hall. If it was possible then, it is still possible. A helipad could be incorporated.

There are a ton of other issues - e.g. the need to keep all 3 acute hospitals, the net loss of beds when all is done and dusted etc. - but I should probably end this email now!

## 19. Chris Bradey, East Stoke Resident

May I pass on to members of the Dorset Health Scrutiny Committee my serious concerns about the CCG plans to re-configure the provision of health care in Dorset? I was fortunate enough to attend the Judicial Review held recently in the Royal Courts of Justice (17 - 18 July) before Judge Sir Stephen Robert Silbey which considered the legality of these proposals. As a resident of Purbeck, living in East Stoke, near Wareham, I was therefore very concerned to hear the conclusions reached by the QC (Jason Coppel) acting for the claimant who had initiated the Review. These were, in sum:

(1) That the Clinical Commissioning Group had not undertaken any audit of the social care workforce required to deliver the new integrated model of care proposed.

Given the context of cuts to Social Services and the lack of any detailed planning evidenced to ensure the recruitment of sufficient staff, the proposal to replace the loss of acute and community hospital beds by care in the community and at home, is therefore aspirational at best. The people of Dorset need more than aspirations: they require certainty that their health needs can be met.

(2) That the Clinical Commissioning Group have not met the statutory bed test intended to ensure that alternative provision is available when acute and community hospital beds are lost.

Instead, they argue that this test does not apply to their proposals because it came into effect after NHS England approved their proposals.

As a resident of Dorset of mature years, I find this to be of small comfort.

(3) That the identification of clinical risk as a result of extended travel times following the closure of Poole A&E and Maternity Departments was only subject to a partial assessment by the South Western Ambulance Service Trust.

The review was limited, did not include those not arriving at these Departments by ambulance (a significant majority of patients), nor did it measure impact on those with the longest travel times. The Trust, to be fair, had requested that further review work be carried out to assess clinical risk: this did not take place.

The Clinical Commissioning Group moreover, made the false claim, derived only from extrapolating figures in the Keogh Report, that their proposals would save 60 lives per year. The Ambulance Trust Review, to the contrary, indicated that over a period of a year, 400 people would be at increased clinical risk as a result of these proposals.

This, surely, should concern any Dorset resident who might at any time require speedy treatment for major trauma, stroke or heart attack. It would also concern any mother to be, anxious for her own health and that of her unborn child.

(It is worth noting that the Clinical Commissioning Group have made selective reference to the Keogh Report when they stated that best practice is to create large, centrally located, hospitals with a range of specialisms, and that their proposals mirror this.

The Report also states that in areas with dispersed, rural, populations, other models are appropriate, and that the needs and wishes of local inhabitants should guide practice. I would suggest that these descriptors apply to Dorset.)

(4) That the Clinical Commissioning Group misled Dorset residents when it promised 24/7 consultant delivered care at Royal Bournemouth Hospital.

It transpired that this is only, once more, an aspiration.

It was disturbing to witness the QC for the Clinical Commissioning Group becoming confused as to the vital difference between Consultant Delivered and Consultant Led care. The Judge expressed his exasperation at this point. A resident of Dorset might be more than exasperated.

(5) That the Clinical Commissioning Group did not make it clear or indicate in the consultation that two thirds of Poole Hospital Beds would be lost.

I have summarised what I heard, in person, at the Judicial Review. Regardless of Sir Stephen's decision (expected at the earliest in September) I would remind Councillors of their statutory duty to refer health plans to the Secretary of State if they believe such plans will not improve health services for their constituents and residents.

The Clinical Commissioning Group's Plans will put Dorset residents, mothers to be and thousands of visitors at increased risk of fatality - even Councillors, too. I would urge members of the Health Scrutiny Committee to refer these plans.

## 20. Bill Dobbs, Shaftesbury Resident

May I take this opportunity to point out a factor probably not appreciated by some CCG decision makers. It is this - The most direct route from Shaftesbury to the

Royal Bournemouth Hospital (52 minutes), is one of the worst roads in the area. It is narrow, potholed, has road edge damage, and the surface is deformed for long stretches. Travel for sick or injured patients will be uncomfortable and in some cases harmful. This road is entirely unsuited for use by an ambulance. Please ensure that the above is considered in CCG deliberations.

# 21. Graham Douglas, Weymouth Resident

With the increasing population in the Poole area the closure of A & E puts lives at risk. The proposal must be revered to Independent Review so that the decision no longer rests on financial grounds.

## 22. Julien and Laraine Parker, Swanage Residents

We write to implore you to vote on 13th September to refer the closure of Poole A&E to an independent review. Over the last twenty years our family have had to rely on Poole A&E on many occasions.

As a family we have had to support a mother with vascular dementia and now our daughter has severe mental health issues. We never know when we might need to go to A&E. If the ferry is not running or queues are very long this means a round trip of approximately fifty miles for all involved.

The roads in the BH area are getting more and more congested. It took us nearly two hours to travel from Bournemouth back to Swanage a couple of weeks ago. We have nothing against specialist units and hospitals sharing their expertise. We know that patients are transferred between Poole and Bournemouth after initial treatment. The crucial moments of diagnosis and treatment would not be lost in extra travelling time.

Secondly by closing many acute beds without having staff in place for replacement community services, something which was failed to be mentioned in the consultation. I feel that parts of the consultation over the closure plans have been so misleading that they could easily be classed unlawful. I would ask that the consultation is looked into again with accurate, truthful information.

Poole hospital A&E and maternity services are vital to the growing local community, to take these away, particularly at the same time as planning to build numerous extra houses would be irresponsible. I hope you will take my concerns (along with many others I'm sure you've received) into account when considering this decision.

## 23. Rosemary Frost, Christchurch Resident

I am writing to you to express my grave concern for Dorset residents health and wellbeing over current plans to merge and move all care from Poole hospital to Bournemouth and to ask that you stand up to address the health needs of local residents and meet your statutory duty to refer health plans that do not improve services for residents.

With the recent travel difficulties due to the Blackwater road works having particularly highlighted the problem which will not go away even once the road works are finished and routes improved there will still be travel holdups with the increase of population and road use.

"Please note that the recent judicial review does nothing to address the clinical risk to Dorset residents who would have to to travel further in an emergency. The CCG calculated from the Ambulance Trust Report, which was about actual Dorset patients attending Poole A&E and Maternity by ambulance last year, that over 4 months 132 were at potential risk of harm from longer journey time, this is 396 Dorset residents over a year. A Dorset A&E Dr said almost half of the cases in the Report were in imminent danger of dying if they had to travel for longer to access help. We calculate 180 people per year going to Poole A&E by ambulance are at risk of dying as a result of these changes. This does not include the risk to mothers-to-be and children as most are excluded from these figures as they do not get to A&E by ambulance. There were almost 600 maternity emergencies treated at Poole last year and 250 newborns needed neo natal intensive or high dependency care at Poole, this level of newborn care is no longer available at Dorset County."

## 24. Ruth Webb, Cheselbourne Resident

I am writing to express my real concern at the CCG's plans to downgrade Poole A&E, close Poole maternity, and close a number of community hospitals. Speaking from bitter experience with my husband and my older daughter, both of whom are severely disabled and have complex health needs, I have never been to DCH A&E without having to wait hours, even when we have been brought in by emergency ambulance. The staff are always great, but clearly worked to the bone and stressed beyond measure. To suggest they have the capacity to receive more patients is ridiculous and will definitely result in more deaths.

I cannot speak from experience of local maternity services except to say that I had to travel to London for an emergency C. Section with my older daughter – for specialist medical reasons – I travelled 2 hours whilst in labour and would not wish that on anyone! Think about the pain, discomfort and the additional risks that will be likely through pregnant women having to travel further. I would urge you to consider this as if it were one of your own family – is this what you would want for them.

Thirdly, closing community hospitals: These hospitals provide vital rehabilitation to patients who no longer need acute hospital services but are not yet fully and safely able to return home. My husband was unable to access this service for various reasons (including poor discharge practice) and as a result lost several weeks of rehabilitation and is now unable to walk – eight months ago he was walking reasonably well. If you reduce this kind of service you are most likely to increase long term disability which will end up being more expensive in the long run.

Instead of closing or reducing services to save money in the short term, please look at the longer view – the costs will be greater in the long term. Instead, press our government to truly finance our NHS properly and resist the pressure to privatise everything. This is not to say that privatising all things is wrong, just to say that some services will be provided better in-house. Also, there are areas where Dorset CCG is choosing expensive options of treatment over cheaper and more patient friendly options. For example, Haemodialysis for almost all kidney failure patients instead of offering the cheaper, gentler, better option of peritoneal dialysis to the many patients who could benefit from preserving any remaining kidney function, and not exposing them to the risk of septicaemia at the same level, whilst preserving the option of haemodialysis for the most serious cases where it is the only option.

I hope you may have the courage to rethink these choices and see that short-termism will not benefit you, your families and the rest of the population in Dorset. Even if you are lucky enough to have private health care, there may be a time when you or a member of your family will need emergency care — this will likely be through the NHS — what option would you want in that case? Please think through these choices with the thought of "how would I like this if I was living in the area — if I had to use these services."

## 25. Alan Marriott, Swanage Resident

As I live in Swanage you will not have heard of me but I think that Dorset Health Scrutiny Committee must vote on 13th September to refer the CCG plans to downgrade Poole A&E and close Poole Maternity for Independent Review, because of the known risk to residents.

# 26. Mary Chipping, Upton Resident

I am very concerned about the proposal to move A&E and Maternity from Poole to Bournemouth. I live at Upton and the last time I had to visit Bournemouth Hospital it took me nearly an hour to get there because the traffic was so very heavy. Coming out was worse - it took over half an hour to even get to the main road! I do appreciate that ambulances have sirens and can push their way through but it is such a long way for people who live farther into Dorset. I have just watched on my TV about the need to get someone who has had a stroke or heart attack to hospital quickly and my fear is that this will not be able to happen. With regards to maternity - people are often travelling by private car on these occasions. With the volume of traffic, and the fact that it all comes to a standstill if there are any roadworks at all, the fear is that babies are going to be born in cars on the way. Poole Hospital A&E and Maternity have a very good reputation which we are loath to lose. Please do your best to keep it.

## 27. Mrs J M Brian, Lytchett Minster Resident

I am so horrified, along with thousands of others, at the idea that A&E facilities could be removed from Poole and centred only in Bournemouth Hospital.

I and other members of my family frequently attend Bournemouth Hospital for various clinics. If an appointment is scheduled between 8 and 10 am one has to allow two hours to travel the fifteen miles from Lytchett to Bournemouth Hospital, and likewise between 4. and 6. pm. At other times I allow at least forty minutes. And then, arriving at the hospital, it may take half-an-hour to find a parking place, or one may not find one at all. For others in Purbeck the situation must be far worse. Please be realistic if you have any say in this matter.

#### 28. Jan Evans, Blandford Resident

I commend you and the other supporters for trying to save such a valuable resource. Living in North Dorset and in the Blandford area it does not take much common sense to establish that to travel from North Dorset to Bournemouth would put lives at risk.

We have proof that my husband having to attend routine eye checks at Bournemouth hospital the journey takes at least 1 hr on a good day without traffic hold ups and

road works. If an emergency occurred then it could take up to 2 hours to get a patient to the Bournemouth hospital - crazy!

The A338 leading from Blandford to Bournemouth is now subjected to long delays due to major road works and it appears that major road works have dogged this journey for many years. With this in mind plus the hospital potentially accommodating patients from the North Dorset area it appears that decisions have been made by executives with concerns at only saving money rather that human lives. I would challenge the health minister to visit the area to see for themselves the ridiculous decision to close such a valuable and much needed resource for all people young and old living in this conurbation.

The air ambulance provided a fantastic service for RTA and a few other emergencies but this great service relies on voluntary and charitable funding to keep it going - this is not good enough for the people of North Dorset to rely on. Does the Government expect us all to rely on charity to keep out health services going?

## 29. Steven and Annabel Nixson, Swanage Residents

We are writing about the proposed closure of NHS services, which would adversely affect those of us living in Swanage. These plans to downgrade Pool A&E and close Poole Maternity would take access to emergency services out of our safe reach.

In addition, there will be cuts to beds and services, which we have not voted for. We will lose vital services and it is not clear how two A & E Departments could cope with all of Dorset's needs.

We are concerned about the judicial review, and would like to see this go ahead, so that the issues can be reconsidered and the current closure proposals rejected, in favour of community safety in Purbeck.

## 30. Mary Zuckerman, Swanage Resident

I am writing as a Purbeck (Swanage) resident to express my shock and great concern at the result of the Judicial Review hearing on 5th September. I feel myself to be personally at risk because of this decision. I am in my 70s and do not own or drive a car. I understand that the Judicial Review was shown evidence that the lives and health of nearly 400 Dorset residents in a year would have been at risk if Poole A &E were closed thus making the journey to hospital in an emergency longer. This is very very worrying. However I am not only concerned for myself, but for those using the Maternity Services at Poole Hospital whose safety, lives and those of their babies will be at so much greater risk if the closures go ahead.

I am therefore writing to ask you and the Dorset Health Scrutiny Committee to please please on all of our behalves to take whatever steps you can to ensure that these valuable resources remain open. I believe this includes the possibility of applying for an independent review into this matter.

## 31. Gill Dight, Swanage Resident

I am a Swanage resident and am e-mailing my concerns regarding the CCG plans for our local services. I was at the December 20th DHSC meeting when we were so badly let down by Councillor Pipe who instead of representing Purbeck District Council's unanimous decision to vote for referral instead acted as an advocate against referral. I was also at the bungled vote by the JHSC on December 12th and am aware that the failure to vote for Independent Review impacted on Judge Silber's decision at the Judicial Review: Judge Silber's report cited the lack of referral for Independent Review by our local Council as influential in his decision.

I am very concerned about the impact the loss of services proposed by the CCG will have on residents. We have heard about the stagnation in British life expectancy and academics are calling for an urgent enquiry into whether austerity is the culprit. I know that 183 deaths (based on Ambulance statistics and therefore likely a chronic underestimate of actual figures) are projected to be lost if these plans are implemented and we lose Poole A&E and Maternity services. This is just not acceptable. My own 83 year old mother fell outside her house in Swanage in June 2017 and waited 3 hours and 21 minutes for an ambulance, she died 2 days later. Any extension of travel times - and the poor turn around at the Royal Bournemouth which my own SWAST investigation revealed - will bring fatalities to all sections of our community. I was struck at the CCG presentation by how close the decision of whether to close Poole or Bournemouth A&E was and I urge the Health Scrutiny Committee to vote for Independent Review of these plans as I fear that the wrong decision has been made and it will have fatal consequences.

I hope that when the Health Scrutiny Committee meets on 17th October to vote again on referral they are not misled by the loss of the Judicial Review, and do not misread the outcome. Referral is a viable alternative and I urge all committee members to vote in favour of referral so that we may find a way to prevent these worrying plans from coming about. I am also writing to my representative Councillor Morris. Thank you.

#### Feedback from Bournemouth & Poole Residents

## 1. Chrissie Brady, Poole Resident

As someone affected by the rationalisation of Dorset NHS, I request that you rescind the plans to make Bournemouth hospital the emergency hospital. People will die. You have said the risk is minimal, but it is not. Dorset CCG knew in August 2017 that at least 396 Dorset patients would be put at risk each year due to loss of Poole A&E and Maternity. Yet in their Decision Making Business Case of September 2017 they said the clinical risk to Dorset patients was 'minimal'. This is a disgrace. It cannot be allowed to go ahead.

## 2. William Parnell, Poole Resident

I am writing to ask you to have the planned removal of A and E and Maternity services from Poole to Bournemouth referred. I think the plans must be referred because of the known risk to residents. The facts are that Dorset CCG knew in August 2017 that at least 396 Dorset patients would be put at risk each year due to loss of Poole A&E and Maternity.

Yet in their Decision Making Business Case of September 2017 they said the clinical risk to Dorset patients was 'minimal'. This is clearly untrue, that is why I believe it is essential that this matter should be referred pending an unbiased review.

# 3. Sylvia Fleming-Maquire, Bournemouth Resident

The plans for closing the above must be referred because of the known risk to residents.

## 4. Helena Rainsford, Poole Resident

The plans regarding the closure of Poole Hospital A&E and Maternity Unit must be referred due to the known risks to residents.

## 5. Miss J Jeffery, Poole Resident

Pease refer for independent review the CCG's plans to close A & E and Maternity at Poole Hospital before your meeting on 13th September. We think the plans must be referred because of the known risk to residents.

## 6. Ben Skipp, Poole Resident

I am writing as a resident of Poole to ask you to please reconsider the reorganisation of Dorset healthcare. It appears to represent a deterioration of services and as such poses a risk to the lives of the people of Dorset.

## 7. William Ahern, Poole Resident

It is in my considered opinion that it is essential the DCC refer for independent review the CCG's plans to close A&E and Maternity at Poole Hospital. These plans must be referred because of a known risk to residents.

#### 8. Claire Manser, Poole Resident

It is in my considered opinion that it is essential the DCC refer for independent review the CCG's plans to close A&E and Maternity at Poole Hospital. These plans must be referred because of a known risk to residents.

## 9. Rebekah Taylor, Poole Resident

I am emailing you to let you know of the great risk you will be putting patients at by closing Poole a and e. Many people rely on this and the nearest a&e is simply too far for most residents! This is a matter of life and death. As I am a local resident, I know how detrimental closing this hospital will be.

## 10. David Taylor, Poole Resident

I would like to register my opposition to the CCG's plans to close Poole Hospitals Maternity Unit and A&E. Given the known risks to local residents, I believe that it should be referred for an independent review. Thank you in anticipation.

## 11. Anthony O'Connor, Poole Resident

Please can you accept this plea to ensure the Health Scrutiny meeting take action to refer to independent review the CCG's decision to close Poole hospital A & E and Maternity.

The road links between Poole and Bournemouth, according to Google maps are some of the most congested in the country. Lives WILL be lost if Poole A&E is closed. There can be no excuse for putting so many lives in danger by considerably increasing the time it will take to attend A&E, not just for ambulances but for members of the public and parents rushing their children to hospital in an emergency. The risks to residents are known but being ignored. Please ensure this matter is highlighted and referred for review.

## 12. Andy Evans, Poole Resident

I am contacting you in connection with the plans to close the A&E at Poole hospital. I understand that a decision is to made shortly and I have some points I want to make.

It is quite clear that these plans pose a serious health risk to the residents of Poole and areas to the west of the town. The A&E departments in both Poole and Bournemouth are already overrun. Travelling from Poole to get to the Bournemouth A&E can take over an hour at busy times in the day. If you close Poole, Bournemouth will become the only available centre for a very large area and a significant part of the local population will be at least an hour from help in an emergency. This cannot be an acceptable risk. There are many elderly local residents (a key demographic for your party) who would not survive such a delay and the same applies to women giving birth, people with industrial and traffic related injuries and the very young. Every part of the local community would be endangered by a closure.

We all know that the NHS is under grave threat. It has been neglected, mismanaged and bled white by outside parties. The fix is surely clear enough but it requires determined and principled action. The challenge is for local and national government to stand up now and address the chronic underfunding, cancel and renegotiate all the idiotic PFI contracts, do away with fat cat executive 'packages' and show some real grit and teeth dealing with drug company profiteering. The alternative is to do nothing about these very real issues and instead do away with a vital local resource and endanger local lives.

The NHS is a national treasure, a gift given to all of us that helps us when we need it. It asks only that we protect and sustain it in return. I urge you very strongly to refer the closure decision to an independent authority which will have the interests of all local people at heart.

# 13. Georgina Knight, Poole Resident

I would like to ask you to refer the plans to close Poole maternity & Poole A&E to be independently reviewed. I don't believe this move is in the interest of patients and I strongly believe the proposals are known to be a risk to patients and will cost lives.

## 14. Karen Russell, Poole Resident

Please review the CCG's plans to close A &E as well as the Maternity Unit at Poole Hospital. Many folk locally view this proposed closure as a serious lack of facilities and would not cover the needs of the local population which is widespread and growing.

## 15. Viv Green, Poole Resident

As a Poole resident I am asking that that at the Health Scrutiny meeting on 13 September the planned closure of A&E and Maternity at Poole Hospital is referred for independent review because of the known risk to residents.

## 16. Geraldine Smith, Poole Resident

I think that Dorset Health Scrutiny Committee should vote on 13th September to refer the CCG plans to downgrade Poole A&E and close Poole Maternity for Independent Review, because of the known risk to residents.

Dorset CCG knew in August 2017 that at least 396 Dorset patients would be put at risk each year due to loss of Poole A&E and Maternity yet in their Decision Making Business Case of September 2017 they said the clinical risk to Dorset patients was 'minimal'.

## 17. Peter Cooper, Poole Resident

I am writing to share my serious concerns re the plans for Poole Hospital services ahead of the Dorset County Councils Health Scrutiny meeting on 13/07/18 I ask that the CCGs plans for closure and reallocation of the maternity unit along with AnE be referred for independent review. There are known risk to residents and as such the decision does not work in the best interests of those it serves.

Please respond to acknowledge this email and to ensure that mine and others voices are heard and acted upon.

#### 18. Alison, Parkstone Resident

I feel the need to voice my concerns over the closure of the above. My husband is a cancer & heart patient at Poole hospital. The fact that it is close by is reassuring as we don't have the service from our doctors surgery for any appointment, let alone an emergency one. The drive to Bournemouth itself could cause a heart attack, our roads are so busy especially in the summer months, there is never enough parking at Bournemouth and if there is a traffic problem it could be a matter of life or death. If you don't have a car you have to rely on public transport-there aren't many buses to

take you straight to Bournemouth hospital and I really don't understand why you want to put peoples' lives in jeopardy to save a few quid.

# 19. Lynne Jackson, Poole Resident

The plans must be referred because of the known risk to residents.

## 20. Helen Farasat, Poole Resident

I am concerned that the CCG plans to close A&E and maternity services at Poole hospital have not paid attention to the risks posed by existing pressure on the local transport infrastructure. The road access routes for patients travelling from the east of the county to the proposed services at the Royal Bournemouth Hospital are extremely congested and prone to major traffic jams. There is evidence to suggest that a significant proportion of patients attending A&E and maternity services travel to hospital by car and without the benefit of the ambulance blue light service. For many of these patients time is of the essence, therefore any risk of prolonging the journey time may pose a serious risk to life.

I would therefore ask, in the interests of achieving the best outcomes for patients, that the Dorset Health Scrutiny Committee refer the CCG plans for independent review.

## 21. Dr R D Hill, Poole Hospital

I am deeply concerned about the proposed changes to the NHS in the Poole and Bournemouth area. I have lived in Poole since 1970 and was a consultant physician at Poole Hospital for nearly 30 years. Although I can appreciate the advantages of concentrating expertise on one site, I do feel that all the factors have not been considered by the decision makers. Although mortality rates may be reduced by being admitted to a specialist unit this will only apply if the patient can get there in a reasonable time. Anyone living in the area will tell you of the horrendous traffic problem even in the off season. These are only likely to get worse. Even now there is the constant noise of sirens from vehicles trying to get through almost grid locked traffic. The proposed reorganisation is only likely to make this worse. There is a sneaking suspicion that the decision makers are either not in touch with reality or they are making decisions on monitory grounds.

## 22. Kim Bill, Broadstone Resident

The plans to lose Poole A &E and maternity wards is appalling based on the longer travelling times due to known traffic issues to Bournemouth Hospital. My husband has had a heart transplant and it's critical to get him seen quickly in the need of any issue. Therefore the plans need to be referred.

#### 23. Di Wellman, Poole Resident

I feel that as there is a known risk to patients these plans should be deferred until September for an independent review.

## 24. Hafsa Badat, Poole Resident

As a Poole resident I am writing to urge Dorset County Council to refer for independent review the CCG's plans to close A&E and Maternity at Poole Hospital because of the known risk to residents.

## 25. Lorna Sage, Poole Resident

Please please don't close our hospital. It is always busy, all those people can't travel all the way to Bournemouth and overcrowd that hospital.

# 26. Amy Bailey, Poole Resident

I write to request that you refer for independent review the CCG's plans to close the A&E and Maternity at Poole Hospital. The plans should be referred because of the known risk to residents.

## 27. Jez Martin, Poole Resident

I wish to record my view that closure of A&E and Maternity at Poole Hospital should be referred to independent review of the CCG's plans. As a user of Poole A&E over the years for various injuries, which i could just about get to under my own power. If had same injuries and had to go to Bournemouth would not be able to get there on my own and would have to get an ambulance at more cost to NHS.

## 28. Sue Mallory, Poole Resident

I understand that Dorset County Council Health Scrutiny meeting will be discussing the CCG's plan to downgrade A&E and maternity services at Poole Hospital. I am writing to urge the committee to refer these plans for independent review, due to the serious risks they pose to the safety of Dorset residents, particularly those who live in Poole or further to the West.

## 29. Julian Flexman, Bournemouth Resident

I gather that the Dorset Health Scrutiny Committee will take a vote on 13 September over the Dorset CCG plans to downgrade Poole Hospital A&E and to close the maternity unit too. According to a report undertaken into the implications of these proposals from the ambulance services that potentially 396 lives would be put at risk due to the longer journey times for patients to be taken to Royal Bournemouth hospital instead.

Given this report that Dorset CCG failed to mention as part of their proposals and consultation documents that were distributed to Dorset residents, I would urge the Dorset Health Scrutiny Committee to vote for an independent review of the Dorset CCG plans. I would be grateful if you could please convey my concerns along with other residents to the committee please.

#### 30. Lisa Ahern, Poole Resident

It is in my considered opinion that it is essential the DCC refer for independent review the CCG's plans to close A&E and Maternity at Poole Hospital. These plans must be referred because of a known risk to residents.

#### 31. Jo-Anna Gillespie, Poole Resident

Before the Health Scrutiny meeting on 13 September I would implore you to refer for independent review the CCG's plans to close A&E and Maternity at Poole Hospital. The plans must be referred because of the known risk to residents.